

Memorandum

To: Cheryl Kitzerow

From: Shane Spicer

Date: September 6, 2018

RE: Rockport Ranch Fiscal Impact Analysis Review

The City engaged Spicer Consulting Group ("SCG") to evaluate the May 4, 2018 Fiscal Impact Analysis for Rockport Ranch prepared by Development Planning & Financing Group, Inc. ("DPFG"). The Rockport Ranch Fiscal Impact Analysis (FIA) proposes fiscal impacts with the proposed residential land use for 305 residential units, consisting of 96 single family detached units and 209 multi-family units over a 20-year time period. The 72.6 acre project is located slightly East of Highway 215 on the Southwestern corner of Newport Road and Briggs Road.

Project Description

The Project is proposing to implement a General Plan Amendment (GPA No. 2016-287), Change of Zone (CZ No. 2016-288), Specific Plan (SP No. 2016-286), and Tentative Tract Map (TR No. 2016-285 [TR 37131]) to allow a subdivision with the proposed planning areas detailed in the land use assumption table below, located on 72.6 acres. Each planning area is anticipated to be comprised of 3 plans; 90 DU's of 40' Wide product with an average square footage of 2,150, 119 DU's of 50' Wide product with an average square footage of 2,860 and 96 DU's of Cluster product with an average square footage of 1,684 (from DPFG FIA).

Planning		Density		Proposed	Target
Area	Residential Land Use Designation	Range	Net Area	DU's	Density
PA-1	Courtyard Residential MHDR	5-8 du/ac	16.8 acres	96	5.71
PA-2	Single-Family Residential MDR	2-5 du/ac	12.8 acres	60	4.69
PA-3	Single-Family Residential MDR	2-5 du/ac	17.6 acres	79	4.49
PA-4	Single-Family Residential MDR	2-5 du/ac	13.3 acres	43	3.23
PA-5	Single-Family Residential MDR	2-5 du/ac	12.1 acres	27	2.23
	Totals		72.6 acres	305	3.83

Project Analysis

The Project's direct impact to the General Fund at build-out is summarized in Table 1 of this report. The primary difference in the analysis prepared by DPFG and the SCG review is that DPFG factored both population and employment in the build-out assumptions for both general fund revenues and expenditures, see Tables 8 and 9 of the Fiscal Impact Analysis for Rockport Ranch. Rockport Ranch is a residential project which should not include employment factors for the service units and utilized no factor for estimated employees. The Per Capita & 50% Employee Multiplier that was utilized for basis of Table 4 results in an inconsistent application of the factor calculated. Overall, DPFG's analysis shows a positive result, however, construction of residential only is typically a net negative fiscal impact to the General Fund of a City.

SCG recalculated the impacts to the City based upon a Residential Population Growth Model based upon a public services analysis. SCG analyzed and recalculated the fiscal impact at Buildout as follows:

Rockport Ranch	Allocable Share	Service Units		oject Cost Impacts
•				
General Government	\$69	854	\$	58,699
Community Development	\$68	854		58,294
Public Works/Engineering	\$51	854		43,611
Community Services	\$31	854		26,616
Public Safety				
Police Services	\$225	854		192,279
Fire Services	\$192	854		163,629
Animal Control Services	\$8_	854		6,550
Total Public Safety	\$424		\$	362,458
Total Expenditures	\$644		\$	549,678
				Project Revenue
Tax Revenues	•	305 Homes	Е	stimates
Property Tax		Table 1	\$	143,331
Property Transfer Tax		m 11 0		8,212
Property Tax In Lieu of VLF		Table 2		74,373
Sales and Use Tax				138,503
_		otal Tax Revenues	\$	364,419
Franchise Fee				19,913
Recreation Program Fees				2,928
Fines & Forfeiture				4,355
Misc. Revenues/Other		al Other Revenues	\$	11,895 39,092
	Subtot	ai omei nevenues	_ <i>.</i> p	37,074
	•	Γotal Revenues	\$	403,510
		Shortfall	\$	(146,167)

TABLE 1: PROPERTY TAX	
#OF HOMES HOME - ESTIMATED VALUE	\$ 305 360,234
TOTAL ASSESSED VALUATION	\$ 109,871,370
AD-VALOREM BASIC RATE	1%
PROPERTY TAXES	\$ 1,098,714
GENERAL FUND - TRA (6.618370%)	\$ 72,717
STRUCTURAL FIRE TAX (6.426982%	\$ 70,614
TOTAL GENERAL FUND PROPERTY TAX	\$ 143,331

A separate analysis was prepared for the City that illustrates the impacts to public safety from development. We prepared a tabular analysis that included information planned for FY 2017-18 and determined the appropriate set of General Fund revenues and expenditures on a per capita basis. SCG evaluated this cost per capita assuming a full build-out scenario and determine the proportionate share associated to the development of new residential properties. This report translates to (\$479) for each newly developed detached single family residential and (\$354) per multi-family residential unit needed to mitigate future impacts.

The analysis in the May 4, 2018 FIA prepared by DPFG is based upon current dollars at buildout so the report must also note that historical and future County estimates for Sheriff Services is expected to be 6% to as much as 12.5% for the next 10 years. The following table illustrates the cost of adding 53% of an officer for the impacts related to Sheriff staffing needs for Rockport Ranch.

SCG obtained information germane to the analysis including: the FY 2016-17 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report; the FY 2017-18 Audited Budget, the FY 2018-19 Draft Budget; the General Plan; the Demographic Market Report; Police and Fire Cost information including related County agreements; and line item budget detail data. From this information a line item detailed database was prepared determining the eligible budget items relevant to providing services to the community.

Recommendations

Given the net negative impact new residential development has on the City's General Fund, the proposed Fiscal Impact Analysis for Rockport Ranch should the proposed land use change be approved the developer will need to mitigate these impacts. The developer could include the \$479 per single-family residential property in a Public Services Community Facilities District or will need to determine other means of paying the annual costs to mitigate its impact to the City's General Fund.

This concludes our review of the Rockport Ranch Fiscal Impact Analysis.

Spicer Consulting Group

Shane Spicer Managing Director

APPENDIX A

GENERAL FUND FISCAL IMPACT ANALYSIS RESIDENTIAL POPULATION GROWTH

City of Menifee General Fund Fiscal Impact Analysis Residential Population Growth

General Fund Expenditures	Service Unit ¹	Per Service Unit	Build-Out LOS
General Government	146,540	\$68.73	\$10,072,322
Community Development	146,540	\$68.26	\$10,002,764
Public Works/Engineering	146,540	\$51.07	\$7,483,402
Community Services	146,540	\$31.17	\$4,567,047
Public Safety			
Police Services	146,540	\$225.15	\$32,993,625
Fire Services	146,540	\$191.60	\$28,077,534
Animal Control Services	146,540	\$7.67	\$1,123,852
Total Public Safety	146,540	\$424.42	\$62,195,011
Total General Fund Expenditures		\$644	\$94,320,547

Total Service Units at Build-out	146,540
New Residential Service Units	54,638
% of Build-out Service Units	37.29%

Allegable Change of Constant Front Front Front Street	\$35,167,777
Allocable Share of General Fund Expenditures	\$35,107,777

General Fund Revenues - New Development	New Homes	Per New Home	Totals
Tax Revenues			
Property Tax	20,890	\$454.58	\$9,496,077
Property Transfer Tax	20,890	\$26.92	\$562,460
Property Tax In Lieu of Sales Tax	20,890	\$17.81	\$372,085
Sales and Use Tax ³	20,890	\$454.11	\$9,486,250
Subtotal Tax Revenues		\$953.42	\$19,916,871
Franchise Fee	20,890	\$65.29	\$1,363,901
Recreation Program Fees	20,890	\$9.60	\$200,543
Fines & Forfeiture	20,890	\$14.28	\$298,308
Misc. Revenues	20,890	\$11.33	\$236,682
Subtotal Other Revenues		\$100.50	\$2,099,434
Total General Fund Revenues			\$22,016,305

General Fund Impact	Service Unit1	Per Service Unit	Totals
Expenditures	54,638	\$643.65	\$35,167,777
Less: Revenues ⁴	54,638	\$472.49	\$25,815,849
Shortfall	54,638	(\$171.16)	(\$9,351,928)

CFD Tax Rates	Factor	Per Service Unit	Tax Rate
Single Family Residential	2.80	\$171.16	\$479
Multi-Family Residential	2.07	\$171.16	\$354

Population as of 2018	91,902	
Estimated Population Growth (thru 2035)	54,638	
Population at Build-out (2035)	146,540	

	FY 2	018-19 ²		I	Projected Build-	Out 2035	
	Operating	\$ Per			Operating	\$ Per	
General Fund Expenditures	Budget	Capita	% of Total	Escalator	Budget	Capita	% of Total
General Government	\$6,276,738	\$68	14%	160%	\$10,072,322	\$69	11%
Community Development	\$6,233,392	\$68	14%	160%	\$10,002,764	\$68	11%
Public Works/Engineering	\$4,663,409	\$51	10%	160%	\$7,483,402	\$51	8%
Community Services	\$2,846,033	\$31	6%	160%	\$4,567,047	\$31	5%
Public Safety							
Police Services	\$12,987,818	\$141		254%	\$32,993,625	\$225	
Fire Services	\$11,052,617	\$120		254%	\$28,077,534	\$192	
Animal Control Services	\$442,400	\$5		254%	\$1,123,852	\$8	
Total Public Safety	\$24,482,835	\$266	55%		\$62,195,011	\$424	66%
Total General Fund Expenditures	\$44,502,407	\$484	100%	112%	\$94,320,547	\$644	100%

Notes:

¹Service Unit defined as estimated residential population

²FY18-19 Expenditure totals are budget totals from City Annual Operating Budget Fiscal Year 2018-19

³Sales and Use Tax estimated using FY18-19 budget per capita rate (\$86.81) applied to estimated population growth

 $^{^4}$ The GF Impact Revenues is estimated using the \$22,016,305 GF Revenues for 2019 escalated at 1% until 2035

APPENDIX B

General Fund Fiscal Impact Analysis Tax Detail

Residential Development	Factor	Total
Total Cumulative SFR Units		15,611
Total Cumulative Residents	2.80	43,710
Constructed SFR Assessed Values	\$380,000	\$5,932,125,714
Total Cumulative Multi-Family Units		5,279
Total Cumulative Residents	2.07	10,928
Constructed MFR Assessed Values	\$260,000	\$1,372,548,792
Total Cumulative Residents		54.638

Population Estimation 2018 Actual	91,902			
Estimated Growth	54,638			
2035 Total Population				
80% SFR Growth	43,710			
20% MFR Growth	10,928			

Residential Property Tax	Factor	Total		
Constructed Assessed Values		\$7,304,674,507		
Ad-Valorem	1.00%	\$73,046,745		
Residential Tax Rate	13.00%			
Total Residential Tax		\$9,496,077		

Residential Property Tax In-Lieu of Sales Tax	\$372,085
---	-----------

Residential Property Transfer Tax	Factor	Total
Residential Property Tax Turnover Rate	14.00%	
Transfer Tax Rate	0.055%	
Total Residential Property Transfer Tax		\$562,460

APPENDIX C
TABLES 1 AND 2 – PROJECT ESTIMATES:

TABLE 1: PROPERTY TAX	
#OF HOMES HOME - ESTIMATED VALUE	\$ 305 360,234
TOTAL ASSESSED VALUATION	\$ 109,871,370
AD-VALOREM BASIC RATE	1%
PROPERTY TAXES	\$ 1,098,714
GENERAL FUND - TRA (6.618370%)	\$ 72,717
STRUCTURAL FIRE TAX (6.426982%	\$ 70,614
TOTAL GENERAL FUND PROPERTY TAX	\$ 143,331

TABLE 2: PROPERTY TAX IN LIEU OF VLF	
CITYWIDE ASSESSED VALUATION	\$ 8,685,564,917 (B)
PROPERTY TAX IN LIEU OF VLF	\$ 6,062,792 (C)
VLF INCREASE PER \$1,000 IN AV (
C/B*1,000)	0.69803082 (A)
TOTAL ASSESSED VALUATION	\$ 109,871,370
LESS: EXISTING AV	 (3,324,896)
	\$ 106,546,474
DIVIDE PROJECT AV / 1,000	\$ 106,546
(A) VLF FACTOR	0.69803082
PROPERTY TAX IN LIEU OF VLF	\$ 74,373

APPENDIX D – ESCALATOR

		General	Community	Public Works/	Community	Public	Police		Animal	Total Public	
Year	Escalator	Government	Development	Engineering	Services	Safety	Services	Fire Services	Control	Safety	Total
2019	3.00%	\$6,276,738	\$6,233,392	\$4,663,409	\$2,846,033	6.00%	\$12,987,818	\$11,052,617	\$442,400	\$24,482,835	\$44,502,407
2020	3.00%	\$6,465,040	\$6,420,394	\$4,803,311	\$2,931,414	6.00%	\$13,767,087	\$11,715,774	\$468,944	\$25,951,805	\$46,571,964
2021	3.00%	\$6,658,991	\$6,613,006	\$4,947,411	\$3,019,356	6.00%	\$14,593,112	\$12,418,720	\$497,081	\$27,508,913	\$48,747,677
2022	3.00%	\$6,858,761	\$6,811,396	\$5,095,833	\$3,109,937	6.00%	\$15,468,699	\$13,163,844	\$526,905	\$29,159,448	\$51,035,375
2023	3.00%	\$7,064,524	\$7,015,738	\$5,248,708	\$3,203,235	6.00%	\$16,396,821	\$13,953,674	\$558,520	\$30,909,015	\$53,441,220
2024	3.00%	\$7,276,460	\$7,226,210	\$5,406,169	\$3,299,332	6.00%	\$17,380,630	\$14,790,895	\$592,031	\$32,763,556	\$55,971,727
2025	3.00%	\$7,494,753	\$7,442,996	\$5,568,354	\$3,398,312	6.00%	\$18,423,468	\$15,678,348	\$627,553	\$34,729,369	\$58,633,785
2026	3.00%	\$7,719,596	\$7,666,286	\$5,735,405	\$3,500,262	6.00%	\$19,528,876	\$16,619,049	\$665,206	\$36,813,132	\$61,434,680
2027	3.00%	\$7,951,184	\$7,896,274	\$5,907,467	\$3,605,269	6.00%	\$20,700,609	\$17,616,192	\$705,118	\$39,021,919	\$64,382,114
2028	3.00%	\$8,189,719	\$8,133,163	\$6,084,691	\$3,713,428	6.00%	\$21,942,645	\$18,673,164	\$747,425	\$41,363,235	\$67,484,235
2029	3.00%	\$8,435,411	\$8,377,158	\$6,267,232	\$3,824,830	6.00%	\$23,259,204	\$19,793,554	\$792,271	\$43,845,029	\$70,749,659
2030	3.00%	\$8,688,473	\$8,628,472	\$6,455,249	\$3,939,575	6.00%	\$24,654,756	\$20,981,167	\$839,807	\$46,475,730	\$74,187,500
2031	3.00%	\$8,949,128	\$8,887,327	\$6,648,906	\$4,057,763	6.00%	\$26,134,042	\$22,240,037	\$890,196	\$49,264,274	\$77,807,397
2032	3.00%	\$9,217,601	\$9,153,946	\$6,848,373	\$4,179,495	6.00%	\$27,702,084	\$23,574,439	\$943,607	\$52,220,131	\$81,619,547
2033	3.00%	\$9,494,129	\$9,428,565	\$7,053,825	\$4,304,880	6.00%	\$29,364,209	\$24,988,905	\$1,000,224	\$55,353,338	\$85,634,737
2034	3.00%	\$9,778,953	\$9,711,422	\$7,265,439	\$4,434,027	6.00%	\$31,126,062	\$26,488,240	\$1,060,237	\$58,674,539	\$89,864,380
2035	3.00%	\$10,072,322	\$10,002,764	\$7,483,402	\$4,567,047	6.00%	\$32,993,625	\$28,077,534	\$1,123,852	\$62,195,011	\$94,320,547